

ON THE NUMBER OF EDGES IN COLOUR-CRITICAL GRAPHS  
AND HYPERGRAPHS

A. V. KOSTOCHKA\*, M. STIEBITZ†

Received June 25, 1998

A (hyper)graph  $G$  is called  $k$ -critical if it has chromatic number  $k$ , but every proper sub(hyper)graph of it is  $(k-1)$ -colourable. We prove that for sufficiently large  $k$ , every  $k$ -critical triangle-free graph on  $n$  vertices has at least  $(k-o(k))n$  edges. Furthermore, we show that every  $(k+1)$ -critical hypergraph on  $n$  vertices and without graph edges has at least  $(k-3/\sqrt[3]{k})n$  edges. Both bounds differ from the best possible bounds by  $o(kn)$  even for graphs or hypergraphs of arbitrary girth.

**1. Introduction**

In this paper, we continue studying colour-critical graphs and hypergraphs with few edges (cf. [10–12]).

A *hypergraph*  $G = (V, E)$  consists of a finite set  $V = V(G)$  of *vertices* and a set  $E = E(G)$  of subsets of  $V$ , called *edges*, each having cardinality at least two. An edge  $e$  with  $|e| = 2$  is called an *ordinary edge*. A *graph* is a hypergraph in which each edge is ordinary. The *degree*  $d_G(x)$  of a vertex  $x$  in  $G$  is the number of the edges in  $G$  containing  $x$ . The subhypergraph of  $G$  induced by  $X \subseteq V(G)$  is denoted by  $G[X]$ , i.e.  $V(G[X]) = X$  and  $E(G[X]) = \{e \in E(G) \mid e \subseteq X\}$ ; further,  $G - X = G[V(G) - X]$ .

---

*Mathematics Subject Classification (1991):* 05C15

\* This author finished his part while visiting Nottingham University, funded by Visiting Fellowship Research Grant GR/L54585 from the Engineering and Physical Sciences Research Council. His research was also supported in part by the grants 97-01-01075 and 99-01-00581 from the Russian Foundation for Fundamental Research.

† The work of this author was supported by a grant from INTAS (project code 97-1001).

Consider a hypergraph  $G$  and assign to each vertex  $x$  of  $G$  a set  $L(x)$  of colours (positive integers). Such an assignment  $L$  of sets to vertices in  $G$  is referred to as a *colour scheme* (or briefly, a *list*) for  $G$ . An  $L$ -colouring of  $G$  is a mapping  $\varphi$  of  $V(G)$  into the set of colours such that  $\varphi(x) \in L(x)$  for all  $x \in V(G)$  and  $|\{\varphi(x) | x \in e\}| \geq 2$  for all  $e \in E(G)$ . If  $G$  admits an  $L$ -colouring, then  $G$  is said to be  $L$ -colourable. In case of  $L(x) = \{1, \dots, k\}$  for all  $x \in V(G)$ , we also use the terms  $k$ -colouring and  $k$ -colourable, respectively.  $G$  is said to be  $k$ -choosable or  $k$ -list-colourable if  $G$  is  $L$ -colourable for every list  $L$  of  $G$  satisfying  $|L(x)| = k$  for all  $x \in V(G)$ . The *chromatic number*  $\chi(G)$  (*choice number*  $\chi_l(G)$ ) of  $G$  is the least integer  $k$  such that  $G$  is  $k$ -colourable ( $k$ -choosable).

We say that a hypergraph  $G$  is  $L$ -critical where  $L$  is a given list for  $G$  if  $G$  is not  $L$ -colourable but every proper subhypergraph of  $G$  is  $L$ -colourable. In case of  $L(x) = \{1, \dots, k-1\}$  for all  $x \in V(G)$ , we also use the term  $k$ -critical. A hypergraph  $G$  is said to be  $k$ -list-critical if  $G$  is  $L$ -critical for some list  $L$  of  $G$  where  $|L(x)| = k-1$  for all  $x \in V(G)$ . Clearly, every  $k$ -critical hypergraph is  $k$ -list-critical.

It is known (see, e.g. [6]) that for every integer  $k \geq 3$ , there are infinitely many  $k$ -critical graphs with average degree less than  $k$ . Our first result is that this is not the case for triangle-free  $k$ -critical graphs provided that  $k$  is large.

**Theorem 1.** *Let  $G$  be a triangle-free graph on  $n$  vertices. If  $G$  is  $k$ -list-critical, then  $G$  has at least  $(k - o(k))n$  edges. In particular, the average degree of  $G$  is at least  $2k - o(k)$ .*

The value  $2k - o(k)$  is asymptotically tight (in  $k$ ), since there are  $k$ -critical graphs of arbitrary girth and with average degree at most  $2(k-2)$  (see, e.g. [2, 3, 9]).

For hypergraphs and large  $k$ , there is a large gap between lower and upper bounds on the number of edges in a uniform  $k$ -critical hypergraph. It was proved in [5, 14–16] that, for given integers  $k \geq 3$ ,  $r \geq 3$  and  $n > k$ , every  $k$ -critical  $r$ -uniform hypergraph on  $n$  vertices has at least  $\max\{1, (k-1)/r\}n$  edges. The hypergraphs obtained by the best known constructions (see [1, 3]) have about  $(k-2)n$  edges. We will prove that these constructions are close to the truth for large  $k$ .

**Theorem 2.** *Let  $G$  be a hypergraph on  $n$  vertices and without ordinary edges. If  $G$  is  $k$ -list-critical, then  $G$  has at least  $k(1 - 3/\sqrt[3]{k})n$  edges.*

Theorem 2 implies, in particular, that every  $(k+1)$ -critical hypergraph on  $n$  vertices and without ordinary edges has at least  $k(1 - 3/\sqrt[3]{k})n$  edges.

Recently, it was proved in [9] that, for every  $k \geq 3$ ,  $r \geq 3$ ,  $g \geq 3$  and infinitely many  $n$ , there are  $(k+1)$ -critical  $r$ -uniform hypergraphs on  $n$  vertices having girth  $g$  and fewer than  $kn$  edges.

### 2. Proof of Theorem 1

The proof of Theorem 1 is mainly based on the following recent result of A. Johansson [7].

**Theorem 3.** *If  $G$  is a triangle-free graph with maximum degree at most  $\Delta$ , then  $\chi_l(G) \leq o(\Delta)$ . ■*

By a *hereditary graph property* we mean a class  $\mathcal{P}$  of graphs such that if  $G$  is a member of  $\mathcal{P}$ , then every graph isomorphic to some induced subgraph of  $G$  is a member of  $\mathcal{P}$ , too. Theorem 1 is an immediate consequence of Theorem 3 and the following result.

**Theorem 4.** *Let  $\mathcal{P}$  be a hereditary graph property such that  $\chi_l(G) \leq f(\Delta)$  for every graph  $G \in \mathcal{P}$  with maximum degree at most  $\Delta$  where  $f(k) = o(k)$ . Then every  $k$ -list-critical graph  $G \in \mathcal{P}$  on  $n$  vertices has at least  $(k - o(k))n$  edges.*

**Proof.** We may assume that  $f$  is a continuous and monotonically increasing function where  $f(0) \geq 1$ . Consequently, there is function  $g$  such that  $g(k)f(g(k)) = k^2$  for every integer  $k \geq 1$ . Then it follows by an easy calculation that

$$(1) \quad (k - f(g(k)))\left(1 - \frac{k}{g(k)}\right) \geq k - 2f(g(k))$$

for every integer  $k \geq 1$ . Furthermore, because of  $f(k) = o(k)$ , we conclude that

$$f(g(k)) = o(k).$$

Next, consider a  $k$ -list-critical graph  $G \in \mathcal{P}$  on  $n$  vertices and  $m$  edges. We show that if  $k$  is sufficiently large, then  $m \geq (k - 2f(g(k)))n = (k - o(k))n$ .

Since  $G$  is  $k$ -list-critical, there is a list  $L$  for  $G$  such that  $G$  is  $L$ -critical and  $|L(x)| = k - 1$  for every  $x \in V = V(G)$ . For  $x \in V$  and  $U \subseteq V$ , let  $d(x:U)$  denote the number of vertices in  $U$  that are adjacent to  $x$  in  $G$ . Let  $X = \{x \in V \mid d_G(x) \geq g(k)\}$ ,  $Y = V - X$ . We distinguish two cases.

**Case 1.** There exists a non-empty subset  $A$  of  $Y$  such that, for all  $a \in A$ ,

$$(2) \quad d(a : V - A) \leq k - 1 - \lfloor f(g(k)) \rfloor.$$

Since  $G$  is  $L$ -critical, there is an  $L$ -colouring  $\varphi$  of  $G - A$ . For the induced subgraph  $G' = G[A]$  of  $G$ , define the list  $L'$  by  $L'(a) = L(a) - \{\varphi(v) \mid av \in E(G) \& v \in V - A\}$  for every  $a \in A$ . From (2) it then follows that, for all  $a \in A$ ,

$$|L'(a)| \geq k - 1 - d(a : V - A) \geq \lfloor f(g(k)) \rfloor.$$

Furthermore, for all  $a \in A$ , we have

$$d_{G'}(a) \leq d_G(a) \leq g(k).$$

Since  $G' \in \mathcal{P}$ , this implies that  $G'$  is  $L'$ -colourable and, therefore,  $G$  is  $L$ -colourable, a contradiction.

**Case 2.** For every non-empty subset  $A$  of  $Y$  there exists an  $a \in A$  such that

$$d(a : V - A) \geq k - \lfloor f(g(k)) \rfloor \geq k - f(g(k)).$$

This implies, in particular, that there is an orientation of  $G$  such that for the indegree of every vertex  $y \in Y$  we have  $d^-(y) \geq k - f(g(k))$ . Clearly,  $d^+(x) + d^-(x) = d_G(x) \geq g(k)$  for every  $x \in X$ . Because of (1) and  $\frac{k^2}{g(k)} = f(g(k)) = o(k)$ , we now conclude that if  $k$  is sufficiently large, then  $(1 - \frac{k}{g(k)}) \geq \frac{k}{g(k)}$  and, moreover,

$$\begin{aligned} m &= \sum_{v \in V} \frac{k}{g(k)} d^+(v) + \sum_{v \in V} \left(1 - \frac{k}{g(k)}\right) d^-(v) \\ &\geq \sum_{x \in X} \frac{k}{g(k)} (d^+(x) + d^-(x)) + \sum_{y \in Y} \left(1 - \frac{k}{g(k)}\right) d^-(y) \\ &\geq k|X| + (k - 2f(g(k)))|Y| \\ &\geq (k - 2f(g(k)))n \end{aligned}$$

This proves [Theorem 4](#). ■

**Remark.** Recently, Johansson [8] proved that for every positive integer  $r$  there is a constant  $c_r$  such that  $\chi_l(G) \leq (c_r \Delta \log \log \Delta) / \log \Delta$  for every  $K_r$ -free graph  $G$  with maximum degree at most  $\Delta \geq 2$ . Using this result, [Theorem 4](#) implies that if  $r$  is an positive integer, then every  $k$ -list-critical  $K_r$ -free graph on  $n$  vertices has at least  $(k - o(k))n$  edges.

### 3. Proof of Theorem 2

We need the Lovász Local Lemma in general form (see e.g. [4, p.53-54]):

**Lemma 1.** Let  $A_1, \dots, A_n$  be events in an arbitrary probability space. A directed graph  $D = (V, E)$  on the set of vertices  $V = \{1, \dots, n\}$  is called a dependency digraph for the events  $A_1, \dots, A_n$  if for each  $i, 1 \leq i \leq n$ , the event  $A_i$  is mutually independent of all the events  $A_j$  such that  $(i, j) \notin E$ . Suppose that  $D = (V, E)$  is a dependency digraph for the above events and suppose there are real numbers  $x_1, \dots, x_n$  such that  $0 \leq x_i < 1$  and

$$\mathbf{P}(A_i) \leq x_i \prod_{(i,j) \in E} (1 - x_j)$$

for all  $1 \leq i \leq n$ . Then

$$\mathbf{P}\left(\bigwedge_{i=1}^n \overline{A_i}\right) \geq \prod_{i=1}^n (1 - x_i).$$

In particular, with positive probability no event  $A_i$  holds. ■

The following technical observation will be also used.

**Claim 1.** Let  $k > 0, 0 < b \leq 1/k$  and  $f(y) = e^{a-by}/(k - y)$ . Then  $f$  is a monotonically increasing function on the interval  $(0, k)$ .

**Proof.** For  $y \in (0, k)$  we have

$$f'(y) = \frac{-b e^{a-by}(k - y) + e^{a-by}}{(k - y)^2} = \frac{e^{a-by}(1 - bk + by)}{(k - y)^2} > 0. \quad \blacksquare$$

**Proof of Theorem 2.** Let  $G = (V, E)$  be a hypergraph on  $n$  vertices and without ordinary edges, and let  $L$  be a list for  $G$  such that  $|L(x)| = k$  for all  $x \in V$ . Assume that  $G$  is  $L$ -critical. Let  $z = \sqrt[3]{k}$ . We have to show that  $|E| \geq k(1 - 3/z)|V|$ . For  $z \leq 3$ , this is evident. Now, assume  $z > 3$ . Define the function  $g$  from the set of positive integers into the set of real numbers by

$$(3) \quad g(m) = \begin{cases} 1 - 1/z & \text{if } m = 1, \\ 2^{1-m}/z & \text{if } m \geq 2. \end{cases}$$

In order to count the number of edges in  $G$ , consider the following *Procedure*:

Step 0: Let  $V_0 = V, E_0 = E$ . If we have

$$(4) \quad w_0(v) := \sum_{\{e \in E_0 | v \in e\}} g(|e|) < k(1 - 3/z)$$

for every  $v \in V_0$ , then stop. Otherwise, choose a vertex  $v_1 \in V_0$  for which (4) does not hold and go to Step 1.

Step  $t$  ( $t \geq 1$ ): If  $t = n$ , then stop. Otherwise, let  $V_t = V_{t-1} - \{v_t\}$  and let  $E_t$  denote the family of all non-empty sets  $e \cap V_t$  where  $e \in E$ . If we have

$$(5) \quad w_t(v) := \sum_{\{e \in E_t \mid v \in e\}} g(|e|) < k(1 - 3/z)$$

for every  $v \in V_t$ , then stop. Otherwise, choose a vertex  $v_{t+1} \in V_t$  for which (5) does not hold and go to Step  $t + 1$ .

First, suppose that the Procedure terminates in Step  $n$ . Then  $V = \{v_1, \dots, v_n\}$  and  $w_{i-1}(v_i) \geq k(1 - 3/z)$  for  $i = 1, \dots, n$ . Let

$$S = \sum_{i=1}^n w_{i-1}(v_i) = \sum_{e \in E_0, v_1 \in e} g(|e|) + \dots + \sum_{e \in E_{n-1}, v_n \in e} g(|e|).$$

On the one hand, we have  $S \geq k(1 - 3/z)|V|$ . On the other hand, we infer that

$$S = \sum_{e \in E} (1 - 1/z + \sum_{i=2}^{|e|} 2^{1-i}/z) < \sum_{e \in E} 1 = |E|.$$

Consequently,  $|E| > k(1 - 3/z)|V|$ .

Now, suppose that the Procedure terminates in Step  $h$ , where  $h < n$ . In the sequel, let  $\tilde{V} = V_h$ ,  $\tilde{E} = E_h$  and  $\tilde{e} = e \cap \tilde{V}$  for every  $e \in E$ . Note that  $\tilde{E}$  is the family of all non-empty sets  $\tilde{e}$  where  $e \in E$ . For every vertex  $v \in \tilde{V}$ , let  $F_v$  denote the set of all edges  $e \in E$  such that  $\tilde{e} = \{v\}$ , and let  $a_v = |F_v|$ . Let  $F = \{e \in E \mid |\tilde{e}| \geq 2\}$ . Since the Procedure stopped in Step  $h$ , for every  $v \in \tilde{V}$ , we have

$$(6) \quad w_h(v) = \sum_{\tilde{e} \in \tilde{E}, v \in \tilde{e}} g(|\tilde{e}|) = a_v(1 - 1/z) + \sum_{e \in F, v \in e} g(|\tilde{e}|) < k(1 - 3/z)$$

and, therefore,

$$(7) \quad a_v < k(1 - 3/z)/(1 - 1/z) < k(1 - 2/z).$$

Since  $G$  is  $L$ -critical, there is an  $L$ -colouring  $\varphi$  of  $G - \tilde{V}$ . To arrive at a contradiction we shall show that  $\varphi$  can be extended to some  $L$ -colouring of  $G$ .

For every edge  $e \in E$  such that  $e \neq \tilde{e}$ , let  $v(e)$  denote an arbitrary vertex of  $e - \tilde{e}$  and let  $\varphi(e) = \varphi(v(e))$ . Define a list  $\tilde{L}$  for  $\tilde{V}$  by

$$\tilde{L}(v) = L(v) \setminus \{\varphi(e) \mid e \in F_v\}$$

for every  $v \in \tilde{V}$ . From (7) it then follows that

$$(8) \quad |\tilde{L}(v)| \geq |L(v)| - a_v = k - a_v > k - k(1 - 2/z) = 2k/z \geq 1$$

for every  $v \in \tilde{V}$ . Consider a random  $\tilde{L}$ -colouring of  $\tilde{V}$ , that is, each vertex  $v \in \tilde{V}$  is coloured independently of all other vertices with a colour  $c_v \in \tilde{L}(v)$  and with equal probability  $1/|\tilde{L}(v)|$ . We say that such a random colouring  $\gamma$  is  $e$ -bad for some  $e \in F$  if all vertices of  $\tilde{e}$  receive the same colour  $c$  and, in case of  $\tilde{e} \neq e$ , we have  $c = \varphi(e)$ . Clearly, if  $\gamma$  is not  $e$ -bad for all  $e \in F$ , then  $\varphi \cup \gamma$  is an  $L$ -colouring of  $G$ .

Let  $Y_e = \bigcap_{v \in \tilde{e}} \tilde{L}(v)$  and  $y_e = |Y_e|$ . For every  $e \in F$ , denote by  $A_e$  the event that our random colouring is  $e$ -bad. Then it follows immediately that, for  $\tilde{e} \neq e$ , we have

$$(9) \quad \mathbf{P}(A_e) \leq \begin{cases} \prod_{v \in \tilde{e}} (k - a_v)^{-1} & \text{if } \varphi(e) \in Y_e, \\ 0 & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases}$$

and, for  $\tilde{e} = e$ , we have

$$(10) \quad \mathbf{P}(A_e) \leq y_e \prod_{v \in \tilde{e}} (k - a_v)^{-1}.$$

In order to show that  $\mathbf{P}(\bigwedge_{e \in F} \overline{A_e}) > 0$ , we apply the Local Lemma. For every  $e \in F$ , let  $x_e = 2^{1-|\tilde{e}|}/kz$  and  $F(e) = \{e' \in F \mid e' \cap e \neq \emptyset\}$ . Clearly, for each  $e \in F$ ,  $x_e < 1$  and the event  $A_e$  is mutually independent of all the events  $A_{e'}$  such that  $e' \notin F(e)$ . In what follows, consider some edge  $e \in F$  with  $|\tilde{e}| = m$ . Then  $m \geq 2$  and

$$\begin{aligned} X(e) &:= x_e \prod_{e' \in F(e)} (1 - x_{e'}) \geq \frac{2^{1-m}}{kz} \prod_{v \in \tilde{e}} \prod_{(e' \in F, v \in e')} (1 - x_{e'}) \geq \\ &\geq \frac{2^{1-m}}{kz} \prod_{v \in \tilde{e}} \exp \left\{ - \sum_{(e' \in F, v \in e')} \frac{1}{zk2^{|\tilde{e}'|-1} - 1} \right\} \\ &\geq \frac{2^{1-m}}{kz} \prod_{v \in \tilde{e}} \exp \left\{ - \sum_{(e' \in F, v \in e')} \frac{2^{1-|\tilde{e}'|}}{zk - 1/2} \right\} \\ &= \frac{2^{1-m}}{kz} \exp \left\{ - \sum_{v \in \tilde{e}} \frac{2zk}{2zk - 1} \sum_{(e' \in F, v \in e')} \frac{2^{1-|\tilde{e}'|}}{zk} \right\} \\ &= \frac{2^{1-m}}{kz} \exp \left\{ - \sum_{v \in \tilde{e}} \frac{2zk}{2zk - 1} \sum_{(e' \in F, v \in e')} \frac{g(|\tilde{e}'|)}{k} \right\}. \end{aligned}$$

From (6) it then follows that

$$(11) \quad X(e) \geq \frac{2^{1-m}}{kz} \exp \left\{ -\frac{2zk}{2zk-1} \sum_{v \in \tilde{e}} \left[ 1 - \frac{3}{z} - \frac{a_v}{k} (1 - 1/z) \right] \right\}.$$

Let  $p(e) = \mathbf{P}(A_e)/X(e)$ . We want to show that  $p(e) \leq 1$ . If  $\tilde{e} \neq e$ , then from (9) and (11) we obtain that

$$p(e) \leq \frac{2^{m-1}kz}{\prod_{v \in \tilde{e}} (k - a_v)} \exp \left\{ \frac{2zk}{2zk-1} \sum_{v \in \tilde{e}} \left[ 1 - \frac{3}{z} - \frac{a_v(z-1)}{kz} \right] \right\}.$$

This implies, using (7) and Claim 1 with  $y = a_v$  and  $b = \frac{2zk}{2zk-1} \frac{z-1}{kz} = \frac{2(z-1)}{2zk-1} \leq \frac{1}{k}$ , that

$$\begin{aligned} p(e) &< \frac{2^{m-1}kz}{(2k/z)^m} \exp \left\{ \frac{2zk}{2zk-1} m \left[ 1 - \frac{3}{z} - \frac{(k-2k/z)(z-1)}{kz} \right] \right\} \\ &\leq \frac{z^{m+1}}{2k^{m-1}} \exp \left\{ \frac{2zk}{2zk-1} m \left[ -\frac{3}{z} + \frac{3z-2}{z^2} \right] \right\} \leq \frac{z^{m+1}}{2k^{m-1}}. \end{aligned}$$

Consequently, because of  $m \geq 2$  and  $z = \sqrt[3]{k}$ , we obtain  $p(e) \leq 1$ . Now, consider the case  $\tilde{e} = e$ . Since  $G$  does not contain ordinary edges, we then have  $|\tilde{e}| = |e| = m \geq 3$ . Furthermore, from (10) and (11) it follows that

$$(12) \quad p(e) \leq y_e \frac{2^{m-1}kz}{\prod_{v \in \tilde{e}} (k - a_v)} \exp \left\{ \frac{2zk}{2zk-1} \sum_{v \in \tilde{e}} \left[ 1 - \frac{3}{z} - \frac{a_v(z-1)}{kz} \right] \right\}.$$

Therefore, as in case  $\tilde{e} \neq e$ , we infer from (12), (7) and Claim 1 that

$$p(e) < y_e \frac{z^{m+1}}{2k^{m-1}}.$$

If  $m \geq 4$ , then, since  $y_e \leq k$  and  $z = \sqrt[3]{k}$ , this implies  $p(e) < z^{m+1}/(2k^{m-2}) \leq 1$ . Now, assume  $m=3$ . If  $y_e \leq 2k/z$ , then we obtain

$$p(e) < \frac{2k}{z} \frac{z^{m+1}}{2k^{m-1}} = \frac{z^m}{k^{m-2}} = \frac{z^3}{k} = 1.$$

If  $y_e > 2k/z$ , then we argue as follows. Since  $y_e \leq k - a_v$  for each  $v \in \tilde{e}$ , we infer from (12) and Claim 1 with  $y = a_v$  and  $b = \frac{2(z-1)}{2zk-1}$  that

$$p(e) \leq \frac{2^{m-1}kz y_e}{y_e^m} \exp \left\{ \frac{2zk}{2zk-1} m \left[ 1 - \frac{3}{z} - \frac{(k-y_e)(z-1)}{kz} \right] \right\}$$



$$\begin{aligned} &= \frac{4kz}{y_e^2} \exp \left\{ \frac{6zk}{2zk-1} \left[ 1 - \frac{3}{z} - \frac{(k-y_e)(z-1)}{kz} \right] \right\} \\ &= \frac{4kz}{y_e^2} \exp \left\{ \frac{6(zy_e - y_e - 2k)}{2zk-1} \right\} =: h(y_e). \end{aligned}$$

The function  $h$  is convex on the interval  $I = [2k/z, k]$ , since, for all  $y \in I$ , we have

$$(\ln h(y))' = -2/y + \frac{6(z-1)}{2zk-1} \quad \text{and} \quad (\ln h(y))'' = \frac{2}{y^2} > 0.$$

Therefore, in order to prove that  $p(e) \leq 1$  for the case  $y_e > 2k/z$  it is sufficient to show that  $h(y) \leq 1$  holds for  $y = 2k/z$  as well as  $y = k$ . Since  $z = \sqrt[3]{k} > 3$ , we have, on the one hand,

$$h(2k/z) = \frac{z^3}{k} \exp \left\{ -\frac{12k}{(2zk-1)z} \right\} = \exp \left\{ -\frac{12k}{(2zk-1)z} \right\} \leq 1.$$

On the other hand, we have

$$\begin{aligned} h(k) &= \frac{4kz}{k^2} \exp \left\{ \frac{6k(z-3)}{2zk-1} \right\} = \frac{4}{z^2} \exp \left\{ \frac{3}{1-1/2z^4} \frac{z-3}{z} \right\} \\ &\leq \frac{4}{z^2} \exp \left\{ 3.04 \frac{z-3}{z} \right\}. \end{aligned}$$

The function  $\tilde{h}(z) = \frac{4}{z^2} \exp \left\{ 3.04 \frac{z-3}{z} \right\}$  reaches its maximum at  $z_0 = 4.56$ , since  $(\ln \tilde{h}(z))' = \frac{9.12-2z}{z^2}$  is positive on  $(0, z_0)$  and negative for all  $z > z_0$ . Since

$$\tilde{h}(4.56) = \frac{4}{4.56^2} \exp \left\{ 3.04 \frac{1.56}{4.56} \right\} < \frac{1}{4.56} \exp \{1.04\} < 1,$$

we also have  $h(k) \leq 1$ . This proves  $p(e) \leq 1$  provided that  $y_e > 2k/z$ .

Therefore,  $p(e) \leq 1$  for all  $e \in F$ . Consequently, by [Lemma 1](#),  $\mathbf{P}(\bigwedge_{e \in F} \overline{A_e}) > 0$  implying that there is an  $\tilde{L}$ -colouring  $\gamma$  of  $\tilde{V}$  such  $\gamma$  is not  $e$ -bad for every edge  $e \in F$ . Hence there is an  $L$ -colouring of  $G$ . This contradiction proves [Theorem 2](#). ■

**Acknowledgment.** The authors thank Michael Molloy for an idea improving the bound of [Theorem 2](#). Thanks are also due to one of the referees for helpful comments.

## References

- [1] H. L. ABBOTT and D. R. HARE: Sparse color-critical hypergraphs, *Combinatorica*, **9** (1989), 233–243.
- [2] H. L. ABBOTT, D. R. HARE, and B. ZHOU: Sparse color-critical graphs and hypergraphs with no short cycles, *J. Graph Theory*, **18** (1994), 373–388.
- [3] H. L. ABBOTT, D. R. HARE, and B. ZHOU: Color-critical graphs and hypergraphs with few edges and no short cycles, *Discrete Math.*, **182** (1998), 3–11.
- [4] N. ALON and J. H. SPENCER: *The Probabilistic Method*, John Wiley & Sons, New York, 1992.
- [5] M. I. BURSTEIN: Critical hypergraphs with minimal number of edges, *Bull. Acad. Sci. Georgian SSR*, **83** (1976), 285–288. In Russian.
- [6] T. R. JENSEN and B. TOFT: *Graph Coloring Problems*, Wiley-Interscience Series in Discrete Mathematics and Optimization, John Wiley & Sons, New York, 1995.
- [7] A. JOHANSSON: Asymptotic choice number for triangle free graphs, DIMACS Technical Report 91–5, 1996.
- [8] A. JOHANSSON: The choice number of sparse graphs, manuscript.
- [9] A. V. KOSTOCHKA and J. NEŠETŘIL: Properties of the Descartes’ construction of triangle-free graphs with high chromatic number, *Combin. Probab. Comput.*, **8** (1999), 467–472.
- [10] A. V. KOSTOCHKA, M. STIEBITZ and B. WIRTH: The colour theorems of Brooks and Gallai extended, *Discrete Math.*, **162** (1996), 299–303.
- [11] A. V. KOSTOCHKA and M. STIEBITZ: Excess in colour-critical graphs, in: *Graph Theory and Combinatorial Biology* (Balatonlelle 1996), Bolyai Soc. Math. Stud., **7**, 1999, 87–99.
- [12] A. V. KOSTOCHKA and M. STIEBITZ: A new lower bound on the number of edges in colour-critical graphs, Preprint 1997, No. 48, IMADA Odense University.
- [13] M. KRIVELEVICH: On the minimal number of edges in color-critical graphs, *Combinatorica*, **17** (1997), 401–426.
- [14] L. LOVÁSZ: Coverings and colorings of hypergraphs, in: *Congressus Numer.*, **8** (1973), 3–12.
- [15] P. D. SEYMOUR: On the two-coloring of hypergraphs, *Quart. J. Math. Oxford*, **25** (1974), 303–312.
- [16] D. R. WOODALL: Property B and the four-color problem, *Combinatorics*, Institute of Mathematics and its Applications, Southend-on-sea, England (1972), 322–340.

A. V. Kostochka

*Institute of Mathematics,*  
 630090 Novosibirsk, Russia  
 and

*University of Illinois*  
 at Urbana-Champaign  
 Urbana, IL61801, USA

[kostochk@math.uiuc.edu](mailto:kostochk@math.uiuc.edu)

M. Stiebitz

*Ilmenau Technical University,*  
 98684 Ilmenau, Germany

[stieb@mathematik.tu-ilmenau.de](mailto:stieb@mathematik.tu-ilmenau.de)